



Exploring the just transition South Africa



Acknowledgements

This paper was generously supported by funding from the Open Society Foundations as part of C40's Global Green New Deal Pilot Implementation Programme. It was produced to inform the programme and provide a useful resource on just transition for cities in the region.

Authors

Regional experts

Neil Overy, Researcher, Writer and Photographer. Research Associate in Environmental Humanities South, University of Cape Town

Richard Halsey, Researcher and Writer at Project 90 by 2030, Cape Town

C40 Cities

Nadia Shah

Jazmin Burgess

Gifti Nadi

Contributors

We are grateful to the city officials from our South African member cities - Cape Town, Durban, Ekurhuleni, Johannesburg, Tshwane - for their valuable inputs and contribution to this research.

C40 Cities

Nathalie Badaoui Choumar

Luisa Miranda Morel

Krisztina Campbell

Constant Alarcon

Contact for this report

Nadia Shah - nshah@c40.org

Jazmin Burgess - jburgess@c40.org

Edited by

Melanie Thompson

Designed by

Edward Cooper, Coopergraphics

Cover Photo: © SolStock, Getty Images



Contents

I. Introduction	3
II. Definition and evolution of just transition	4
2.1 What is “just” in the just transition?	5
III. Overview of the just transition agenda in South Africa	7
3.1 National processes and planning	8
3.2 Actions at the subnational level	9
3.3 Projects and initiatives	10
IV. Stakeholder views of just transition	12
V. The role of cities in delivering South Africa’s just transition	17
5.1 The challenges in South African cities	18
5.2 Just transition opportunities for South African cities	22
5.3 Just transition opportunities for South African cities	22
5.3.1 Policy developments	25
VI. Conclusion	34
Further Reading	35



Credit: © Johannes Mann, Getty Images

I. Introduction

The C40 cities' Global Green New Deal (GGND) programme aims to support targeted cities to put 'inclusive climate action at the centre of all urban decision-making, to create thriving and equitable communities for everyone'. The programme is exploring what "just transition" means in practice within nine cities around the world, five of which are South African cities: Cape Town, Durban, Ekurhuleni, Johannesburg, and Tshwane.

This research report identifies the potential roles and responsibilities of cities in implementing a just transition in South Africa, and aims to serve as a key resource for South African cities to improve their understanding of the national context and key plans, policies and projects relating to just transition. It is a starting point to support city engagement in just transition and to identify what further research and analysis is required to assist cities.

*** The views expressed in this paper are not those of C40 Climate Leadership Group, nor our member cities. The intention of this paper is to stimulate discussion as part of C40's just transition pilot in South Africa.



Credit: © SolStock, Getty Images

II. Definition and evolution of just transition

The concept of “just transition” first rose to prominence in the 1970s, when it focused mainly on how energy sector workers in the United States could be supported after they lost their jobs due to the adoption of environmental protection policies. During the 1980s and 1990s the concept spread around the world and was broadened to include environmental justice within the context of the climate crisis, embracing entire communities rather than purely workers. In 2015, after extensive consultation with key players in government and the business sector, the International Labour Organization (ILO) approved the *Guidelines for a just transition towards environmentally sustainable economies and societies for all* (the ILO Guidelines for a just transition), which have greatly influenced the development of the concept.² In recent years, the growing popularity of the concept has resulted in more expansive definitions from environmental, human rights and labour organisations so that it includes wider concerns such as poverty, racism, sexism, indigenous rights, food and energy justice, and overall global inequality.³

In particular, the concept of just transition now includes a wide range of social and economic issues relevant to cities and where city governments have policy jurisdiction such as the right to decent, affordable, energy-efficient and climate-resilient housing, and the provision of non-polluting, accessible public transportation⁴. In this broad definition, the need to transition away from fossil fuels clearly presents an opportunity to transition towards sustainable and equitable cities for all.

¹ The principles of the Global Green New Deal programme can be viewed here: <https://www.c40.org/global-green-new-deal>. Accessed 9 May 2021.

² ‘Guidelines for a just transition towards environmentally sustainable economies and societies for all’, International Labour Organisation, 2015, https://www.ilo.org/global/topics/green-jobs/publications/WCMS_432859/lang--en/index.htm. Accessed 27 May 2021.

³ M. Henry et al., ‘Just Transitions: Histories and futures in a post-COVID world’, *Energy Research & Social Science*, 68, 2020, p. 2.

⁴ T. Schwanen, ‘Low-Carbon Mobility in London: A Just Transition?’, *One Earth*, 2(2), February 2021 and Just Transition Fund - Briefing EU Legislation in Progress 2021-2027 MFF, European Parliament, April 2021.

Box 1: The broad aims of just transition

The complex and profoundly transformative nature of the multiple objectives and overarching goal of just transition that cities may face is recognised through C40's GGND Principles, which define just transition as a:

“Sector-, city-, region- or economy-wide process that produces the plans, policies and investments so that everyone has social protection; all jobs are decent; emissions are low or at zero; poverty is eliminated; and communities are thriving and resilient.”

Just transition has become topical in South Africa in recent years, with the term regularly appearing in newspaper headlines, political speeches, research reports, and private and public sector planning documents. However, this prevalence does not mean that there is any consensus on what it exactly means, or that it has been formally implemented. This is largely because stakeholders are still grappling with the concept as they try to find common areas of agreement among a wide range of views on how it should be understood and implemented within South Africa.

2.1 What is “just” in the just transition?

How the word “just” as understood within current debates on just transition is central to any understanding of the concept. There are several important elements of fairness and justice within the context of the climate crisis and just transition, a few of which are explained below.

- **Distributive justice** is concerned with the fair and equitable distribution of ‘environmental goods, costs and benefits to all members of society, with an emphasis on improving the welfare of the least advantaged in society’.⁵ It is interested in the socially just allocation of resources during and after the transition away from fossil fuels;
- **Economic justice** is the ‘equitable economic development that realises socioeconomic rights, and ensures a thriving, democratic, environmentally sustainable, and inclusive economy that places the needs of the majority at the centre’;⁶
- **Energy justice/democracy** explicitly centres the concerns of marginalised communities and aims to make energy more accessible, affordable, clean and democratically managed for all communities;⁷
- **Environmental justice** will be achieved when everyone enjoys the same degree of protection from environmental and health hazards and equal access to the decision-

⁵ S. Hughes and M. Hoffman, ‘Just Urban Transitions: Toward a Research Agenda’, *Wires Climate Change*, 11(3), 2020, p. 3.

⁶ Institute for Economic Justice (2018) ‘Submission to the National Council of Provinces Select Committee of Economic and Business Development on the National Minimum Wage Bill and BCEA Amendment Bill’, June 2018, p. 3.

⁷ Initiative for Energy Justice, ‘Summary: Energy Justice’, The Energy Justice Workbook, <https://iejusa.org/section-1-defining-energy-justice/>. Accessed 24 May 2021.

making process to have a healthy environment in which to live, learn, and work'.⁸ This definition has been broadened to include wider issues of social justice such as cultural norms and values, rules, regulations, behaviours, policies and decisions to support sustainability;

- **Justice as recognition** is related to distributive justice, and seeks to recognise that the equal distribution of resources may not be enough to bring about equity. It therefore focuses on the different needs of marginalised people in terms of diversity and intensity of need, particularly previously and currently marginalised groups;
- **Procedural justice** focuses on the importance of recognising who it is that makes decisions and how decisions are made. It is specifically interested in the fairness and inclusiveness of decisions and decision-making and addresses whose voices are heard and within which fora;
- **Restorative justice** aims to repair the harm of previous environmental injustices and ensure that such harms do not reoccur.

It is important to consider all these forms of justice during any discussions on just transition in order to evaluate who is defining what is just, and for whom. Thus, just transition is not simply a technocratic process that involves only technological, infrastructural and engineering fixes. Nor is it one that is narrowly focused on policy management, despite these understandings being prevalent in much of the literature on just transition.⁹ Just transition inevitably involves stakeholders in intensely ethical and moral questions about the nature of justice and in deeply political issues such as the causes of climate change and poverty. It is critical, therefore, that cities understand that they will have to involve themselves in political as well as technological processes in order to achieve just transition.

Box 2: Narrative bias towards the energy sector

A year-long stakeholder engagement process on just transition in South Africa undertaken by the National Planning Commission (NPC) identified energy, water and land use – covering agriculture, mining, urbanisation, transport and waste management (including air pollution) – as three key areas of intervention. The follow-up report argued that addressing poverty, inequality and unemployment was ‘at the heart of the work on a just transition’.¹⁰ However, in South Africa the discourse to date has focused mainly on the energy sector – in particular, the shift away from coal as a source of electricity generation – hence the popular use of the term “just energy transition”, which some authors write it as “just (energy) transition” to show that energy is only one part of the wider concept.

⁸ United States Environmental Protections Agency, ‘Environmental Justice’, <https://www.epa.gov/environmentaljustice>. Accessed 24 May 2021.

⁹ K. Jenkins, ‘Energy Justice, Energy Democracy, and Sustainability: Normative Approaches to the Consumer Ownership of Renewables’, in J. Lowitzsch, *Energy Transition: Financing Consumer Co-Ownership in Renewables*, Springer, 2019, p. 80; and N. Healy and J. Barry, ‘Politicizing energy justice and energy system transitions: Fossil Fuel divestment and a “just transition”’, *Energy Policy*, 108, 2017, p. 452.

¹⁰ National Planning Commission, (2019) ‘2050 Vision and Pathways for a Just Transition to a low carbon, climate resilient economy and society’, 2019, pp. 3-7. <https://oneworldgroup.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/NPC-JT-Vision-and-Pathways-draft-2-final.pdf>. Accessed 15 May 2021.



Credit: © Anaya Katlego, Unsplash

III. Overview of the just transition agenda in South Africa

This section provides a high-level overview of the status of the just transition agenda in South Africa. It is followed by a summary of processes and planning, stakeholder views, and a brief account of the initiatives taking place to realise a just transition in South Africa.

By 2011, “just transition” was already a central pillar in the climate change policy framework of the Congress of South African Trade Unions (COSATU).¹¹ In 2012, the national development plan (NDP) recognised just transition as a necessary component in moving to a low-carbon economy.¹² Since then, civil society, communities, academics and some municipalities and provinces have been increasingly involved in debates on just transition. More recently, representatives from youth, business and industry have joined these discussions as the frequency of dialogues and research dedicated to just transition has accelerated.

As elsewhere, just transition in South Africa is highly complex: it challenges “business-as-usual”, threatens entrenched power networks, and promises systemic change in many sectors of the economy and society. These challenges mean that it must be properly managed if trust in the overall process is to be achieved among all stakeholders. This trust can be built if the significant opportunities it can provide – such as decent jobs, environmental restoration, improved living conditions, access to basic services, and the mitigation of climate change impacts – are properly planned for and realised.

¹¹ COSATU, (2011) ‘Congress of South African Trade Unions policy framework on climate change’, <https://www.polity.org.za/article/cosat-congress-of-south-african-trade-unions-policy-framework-on-climate-change-19112011-2011-11-19>. Accessed 11 May 2021.

¹² National Planning Commission, (2012) ‘National Development Plan 2030. Our future- make it work’, 2012, pp. 211-214 https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis_document/201409/ndp-2030-our-future-make-it-workr.pdf. Accessed 11 May 2021.

Relatively few organisations have formally declared their position on a just transition in South Africa. For example, groundWork¹³, which is a non-profit environmental justice service and developmental organisation that has been working with coal communities on aspects of the just transition for many years, argues that because the debate is ongoing in affected community groups, it has not yet formulated a comprehensive position.¹⁴ The youth-led African Climate Alliance¹⁵ is still building a knowledge base before views will be articulated.¹⁶ Some stakeholders have developed a list of principles, following the approach of the ILO. For example, the Climate Justice Charter drew on input from multiple stakeholder groups to develop its eight principles for a ‘deep’ just transition in South African society.¹⁷

3.1 National processes and planning

International experience has shown that the first step in a sequential framework for a just transition must be stakeholder dialogue and engagement: those who are affected should be included in the decision-making process at the earliest possible point. A fully inclusive process from the start improves planning, research, coordination and acceptance, and is a form of procedural justice.

South Africa does not yet have an overarching just transition plan, nor is there one for the energy sector. However, there have been various actions that are beginning to lay the foundations.

Legislation

Current legislation in South Africa is far too limited to drive a transformative just transition, although certain dimensions are targeted in existing policies.

Some laws are aimed at reform of the energy sector. For example, the Carbon Tax Act of 2019 gives effect to the polluter-pays principle by specifying a price on carbon emissions. This provides a financial incentive to shift to lower carbon processes, but it does not necessarily mean it will be done in a just way.¹⁸ Amendments to the Electricity Regulations on New Generation Capacity in 2020 pave the way for municipalities in good financial standing to develop or obtain capacity from independent power producers (IPPs).¹⁹

The Climate Change Bill that has been pending finalisation as an Act since 2018 will, according to the Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries, ensure both a low-carbon transition and justice.²⁰ However, although the interpretation and application of

¹⁴ D. Hallows, groundWork, personal communication, 20 May 2021.

¹⁵ See <https://africanclimatealliance.org/>.

¹⁶ G. Klaasen, Youth Coordinator of African Climate Alliance, personal communication, 25 May 2021.

¹⁷ South African Food Sovereignty Campaign and Co-operative and Policy Alternative Centre, (2020) ‘Climate Justice Charter - Introductory Guide’, 2020, pp. 9-10. https://www.safsc.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/CJC_IntroDoc_Aug2020_EN.pdf. Accessed 24 May 2021.

¹⁸ ‘Act No. 15 of 2019: Carbon Tax Act’, The Presidency, 2019. http://www.gpwonline.co.za/Gazettes/Gazettes/42483_23-5_Act15of2019CarbonTaxAct.pdf. Accessed 15 May 2021.

¹⁹ T. Creamer, (2020) ‘Electricity regulations amended to allow municipalities to develop or buy power’, Engineering News, 16 October 2020. <https://www.engineeringnews.co.za/article/electricity-regulations-amended-to-allow-municipalities-to-develop-or-buy-power-2020-10-16>. Accessed 26 May 2021.

²⁰ Department of Environment, Forestry and Fisheries, (2018) ‘Minister Edna Molewa published National Climate Change Bill for public comment’, https://www.environment.gov.za/mediarelease/molewa_publishes_nationalclimatechangebillforpubliccomment. Accessed 27 May 2021.

the Act must ‘ensure a just transition for all towards an environmentally sustainable economy and society’, it does not include a definition of a just transition.²¹

Accountability and implementation

The Presidential Jobs Summit in October 2018 agreed to establish a Presidential Climate Change Coordinating Commission (P4C) tasked with overseeing and coordinating a national just transition that would seek to maximise job opportunities.²² However, its members, from the State and a range of social partners, were not announced until December 2020 and so its work is just beginning.²³ The P4C will continue the work initiated by the NPC, and create a national just transition framework incorporating findings from recent research and stakeholder consultation.

3.2 Actions at the subnational level

It is essential to have just transition plans tailored to local circumstances.²⁴ This is where municipalities and cities can play a key role, because they are closest to their citizens, have strong understanding of local needs and are therefore best positioned to do this important work. Several provisional recommendations are included later in this report illustrating actions that cities can take.

At the subnational level, most provinces are at least at the drafting stage of “green economy” plans or frameworks. While there is overlap with the low-carbon aspect of just transition, a focus on goals such as ‘green growth’, ‘green jobs’ and ‘green investment’ does not guarantee justice in processes or planning. Care must be taken that the injustices of the current economy and energy planning are not replicated in any future green economy. Encouragingly, Mpumalanga is working on a dedicated just transition plan, the draft (as of May 2021) of which contains concrete recommendations for the provincial government to implement.²⁵



Credit: © Markus Spiske, Pexels

²¹ Department of Environmental Affairs, (2018) Climate Change Bill, p.15. http://www.gpwonline.co.za/Gazettes/Gazettes/41689_8-6_EnvironAffairs.pdf. Accessed 15 May 2021.

²² Republic of South Africa, (2018) ‘Presidential Jobs Summit Framework Agreement’, pp. 42–43. https://www.gov.za/sites/default/files/gcis_documents/Jobs_Summit_FrameWork_Agreement.pdf.

²³ ‘Presidential Climate Change Coordinating Commission appointed’, The Presidency, 17 December 2020. <http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/press-statements/presidential-climate-change-coordinating-commission-appointed>. Accessed 15 May 2021.

²⁴ R. Halsey et al., (2019) ‘Remaking our Energy Future: Towards a Just Energy Transition (JET) in South Africa’, Project 90 by 2030, 2019, p. 38. <https://90by2030.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/Remaking-our-Energy-Future.pdf>. Accessed 24 May 2021.

²⁵ J. Burton, researcher for Mpumalanga Just Transition Plan, personal communication, 25 May 2021.

3.3 Projects and initiatives

To date, most just transition efforts in South Africa remain at the preparatory stage. They are mostly concerned with gathering data to inform planning and establishing necessary structures, but little has yet translated to tangible action on the ground. The country does, however, have a good foundation to build upon. The existing research base is sufficient to start producing dedicated just transition plans, especially as there is momentum building through various networks and campaigns. What is currently missing is sufficient local level pilot projects. This presents a possible opportunity for cities to drive just transition projects relevant to their circumstances.

There are number of initiatives that are at earlier stages of development. Examples include the development of a just transition strategy for Emalahleni municipality (by Sustainable Energy Africa), a study on mining town revitalisation with focus on Carolina (by Agence Française de Développement), and a finance roadmap for just transition in South Africa (by TIPS, the National Business Initiative (NBI) and the London School of Economics).²⁶

Case study 1:

Kwazakhele Transition Township in Gqeberha, Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality

Successful cooperatives at the city level can contribute meaningfully to the objectives of just transitions.²⁷ The implementation of the SaITuba pilot cooperative in Kwazakhele, Gqeberha, and its subsequent growth, is an example of how cooperatives can further urban just transitions.

Since its formation in 2015 among 36 households in Kwazakhele, the cooperative has successfully implemented food sovereignty gardening (i.e. choosing what food they wish to grow, distribute and eat), water harvesting and renewable energy generation. The food garden project, which started in 2016, harvests two crops a year and generates more than ZAR 800 a year in revenue, as well as providing food to cooperative members. In 2019, a 5kW solar array was built by the community, from which is expects to make nearly ZAR 8000 a year in electricity sales to the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality. All revenue raised is returned to the cooperative, where members decide how it should be used. Plans are currently in place to increase the size of the solar array and to develop a recycling project.²⁸

²⁶ J. Burton, personal communication, 25 May 2021.

²⁷ V. Satgar, (2019) *Co-operatives in South Africa: Advancing Solidarity Economy Pathways from Below*, UKZN Press, Durban, 2019.

²⁸ G. Rogers, (2019) 'Kwazakhele takes the gap', *The Herald*, 17 September 2019, <https://www.heraldive.co.za/news/2020-09-17-kwazakhele-takes-the-gap/>. Accessed 23 May 2021.

There are several significant factors which have made this project such a success:

- Broad support for the project from the community – The initial idea for the project came from a Kwazakhele resident, and its subsequent development has been guided at all times by collective input from community members, some of whom joined a participatory Community Research Team that widely canvassed opinions in Kwazakhele to establish exactly what community members wanted. Thus, the project was informed by a ground-up, rather than a top-down approach which can characterise other cooperatives projects.²⁹ This community participation has continued throughout the growth of the project because it is viewed as an essential guiding principle to ensure its long-term viability;
- Ongoing support from the Nelson Mandela Bay Metropolitan Municipality has been provided since the project's inception in several critical ways: (1) support has been consistent, even through a change in government within the metro; (2) support has been expressed by the involvement of local councillors, mayors and other city officials, particularly from the electricity department; (3) the metro also released land to the project for it to be able to establish its food garden and solar panels. This “gap tap” land is land that has not been developed because it previously housed shared tap facilities which are no longer needed now that homes have been connected to water supplies. There are approximately 120 “gap tap” parcels of land in Kwazakhele and the project seeks to establish cooperatives for each of them;³⁰ and (4) the metro assisted in the development of the project by enabling cooperative members to be able to make money from electricity sales, via the metro's feed-in tariff;
- Long-term support from the University of Nelson Mandela in Gqeberha – both technical (direct and via training) and institutional (use of computer labs). All large metros in South Africa host universities from which they could source similar types of support;
- Cohesive multi-stakeholder support – all the structures involved were able to work together towards the project's goals. This encouraging development indicates that communication and consultation structures established during the development of the project are clearly working well.

This example highlights the importance of land to community projects and how it is necessary, where possible, for cities to release land to communities. Further, a feed-in tariff can provide much needed resources to community projects. It is estimated that if each of the 120 ‘gap tap’ areas installed 50 kW of solar power, they would raise approximately ZAR 50 million a year.³¹ It also shows that cities need to incorporate developments like the SaITuba cooperative into both their budgeting and planning via their integrated development plans (IDPs). This means that they need to be able to recognise projects that are working and offer funding to support their growth.

²⁹ P. Brennan et al., ‘Transition Township: Kwazakhele and the Co-operative Space’, in Satgar (2019), p. 251.

³⁰ See note 27 (Brennan in Satgar (2019), pp. 266 and 269).

³¹ S. Robins, (2020) ‘The real State of the Nation lies underground in broken sewerage and water pipes’, *Daily Maverick*, 6 February 2020, <https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2020-02-06-the-real-state-of-the-nation-lies-underground-in-broken-sewerage-and-water-pipes/>. Accessed 23 May 2021.



Credit: © brizmaker, Getty Images

IV. Stakeholder views of just transition

The roles, positions and demands of the main stakeholder groups around a just transition are complex and constantly evolving. There is variation in the level of familiarity with the concept, and among groups at a similar stage of engagement with the topic, there are differing views. Furthermore, even when parties agree on a set of outcomes, there is not always agreement on how to achieve them. This section provides a brief overview of current stakeholder views. A more comprehensive overview of the specific organisations and entities involved has been created in the form of two online stakeholder maps developed by Climate Investment Funds and Just Urban Transitions.³²

There are many shared concerns among stakeholders, covering issues such as jobs, pollution and climate change. However, stakeholders usually place different emphasis on these concerns which tend to reflect their core mandates. The summary below gives an indication of where respective stakeholder *priorities* lie – even though some of them are still aspirational.

³² B. Martin and M. Ward, 'Just Transition Stakeholder Mindmap', *Climate Investment Funds*, https://www.climateinvestmentfunds.org/sites/cif_enc/files/knowledge-documents/supporting_just_transitions_south_africa_mindmap.pdf; and L. Hermanus and S. Kuse, 'South African Just Transitions Stakeholder Map', *Just Urban Transitions*, <https://justurbantransitions.com/mapping-the-transition/>. Accessed 24 June 2021.

Table 1. An overview of stakeholder roles and views on the just transition in South Africa

Roles and interest areas	Views
<p>National government Regularly acknowledges the importance of a just transition, but still needs to complete an enabling framework and supporting regulations. The handling of a just transition by different departments does not yet indicate a coordinated approach.</p>	
<p>Provide sufficient platforms for public participation and stakeholder engagement;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commission research required to inform decision-making; • Develop and implement the necessary plans, policies and laws for a just transition in South Africa; • Allocate and mobilise resources (including national budget lines and other finances); • Appoint oversight bodies to monitor and evaluate progress on just transition activities. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The National Planning Commission (NPC) pushed for a broad and inclusive approach to just transition, including addressing poverty, inequality and unemployment; • There is a strong recognition of the central importance of water, energy and land use; • Despite the NPC work, statements from national government are often narrower, focusing on fossil fuels and associated workers. For example, in April 2021, President Ramaphosa explained that: ‘A just transition is one in which the country reduces its reliance on fossil fuels and its emission of greenhouse gases while sustaining economic growth, creating jobs and protecting those most affected by these changes.’³³ • While there are diverging views on how the state-owned electricity utility, Eskom, should transform to best contribute towards a just transition, the President announced in 2019 that it will be split into three components: Generation, Transmission and Distribution.³⁴
<p>Trade unions Some points have been raised by individual unions, others by union federations such as the Federation of Unions of South Africa (FEDUSA).</p>	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negotiate on behalf of members, and put workers front and centre in the debate; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support the ILO Guidelines for a just transition as a minimum standard; • A shift to a low-carbon economy is essential, but it must not come with net job losses; • Seek a shift from exploitative practices and expansionist logic linked to capitalism;

³³ ‘From the desk of the President’, The Presidency, 26 April 2021. <http://www.thepresidency.gov.za/from-the-desk-of-the-president/desk-president%2C-monday%2C-26-april-2021>. Accessed 24 Jun 2021.

³⁴ South African Government, (2019) ‘2019 State of the Nation Address’, 7 Feb 2019, <https://www.gov.za/speeches/president-cyril-ramaphosa-2019-state-nation-address-7-feb-2019-0000>. Accessed 24 Jun 2021.

- Advocate for security of quality jobs and decent work, maximising additional job creation and protection of communities from environmental degradation and pollution.

- Support publicly or socially owned renewable energy’
- Anti-privatisation of renewable energy, such as though IPPs;
- Anti-privatisation of state-owned entities (such as Eskom);
- Labour movement should lead in the just transition process;
- Just transition plans should be created before power station closures.

Examples of demands³⁵

- COSATU: ‘putting the needs of working and poor people first in the social and economic changes ahead of us’,³⁶
- COSATU policy on climate change lists seven basic just transition demands covering: decent jobs, social protection, research, skills development, inclusion in climate change commitments, support for ILO as a monitoring body,³⁷
- SAFTU (2019) states that there is a need for a specific platform for social dialogue on the energy transition, because the National Economic Development and Labour Council (NEDLAC)³⁸ is not sufficiently inclusive;³⁹
- FEDUSA (2019) called on the Government to respond to technological disruptions in the workplace (4th industrial revolution) in line with just transition principles.⁴⁰

Civil society

Includes civil society organisations, non-profit organisations and academia.

- Hold government accountable;

- Led by requirements of science on climate change and the need to meaningfully address socioeconomic issues;
- Often highlights human health and environmental protection elements;

³⁵ SAFTU - South African Federation of Trade Unions, FEDUSA - Federation of Unions of South Africa.

³⁶ COSATU, (2017) ‘A just transition to a low-carbon and climate resilient economy’, 2017, p1. https://www.sagreenfund.org.za/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Naledi_A-just-transition-to-a-climate-resilient-economy.pdf. Accessed 24 May 2021.

³⁷ See note 36 COSATU (2017), p. 56.

³⁸ The National Economic Development and Labour Council (NEDLAC) ‘is the vehicle by which government, labour, business and community organisations seek to cooperate, through problem-solving and negotiation, on economic, labour and development issues and related challenges facing the country’ <https://nedlac.org.za/#>. Accessed 28 May 2021.

³⁹ T. Creamer, (2019) ‘South Africa’s energy transition won’t be ‘just’ in absence of inclusive social dialogue’, Engineering News, 7 May 2019. https://www.engineeringnews.co.za/article/south-africas-energy-transition-wont-be-just-in-absence-of-inclusive-social-dialogue-2019-05-07/rep_id:4136. Accessed 25 May 2021.

⁴⁰ ‘FEDUSA Calls for a Coherent Response to the 4th Industrial Revolution this May Day’, *Polity*, 30 April 2019. <https://www.polity.org.za/article/fedusa-fedusa-calls-for-a-coherent-response-to-the-4th-industrial-revolution-this-may-day-2019-04-30>. Accessed 25 May 2021.

- Push for compliance with regulations (and litigate where necessary);
- Facilitate debate;
- Undertake and share research;
- Advocate for change;
- Host networks and discussion platforms;
- Capacity-building with grassroots organisations.

- Agrees that just transition is more than just the energy sector;
- The lack of political will to move beyond rhetoric towards action is delaying important transition steps that need to be implemented;
- Recognises the need for a just transition plan that is equitable, inclusive, transparent and well resourced;
- Against the funding of further fossil fuel projects.

Examples of positions or demands:

- 350.org has a position that a ‘just transition should at minimum provide a protective just transition for workers and communities and that we must strive towards a transformative just transition, which creates a more just, equitable, sustainable and regenerative economy’;⁴¹
- The Green New Eskom campaign has 18 demands for how to transform Eskom and the energy sector;⁴²
- Project 90 by 2030 has developed a set of building blocks it considers are a minimum for a just energy transition.⁴³

Community and youth

A major shortcoming to date has been the insufficient inclusion of community and youth voices in national processes.

- Bring real stories and lived experiences into decision-making, because communities are often the most immediately affected by economic and environmental issues;
- Highlight injustices of the current system, based on first-hand experience.

- Want information that is accessible and in relevant languages;
- A just transition is about more than jobs but it is also about improving living conditions, land restoration and access to basic services;
- Household energy sources, electricity in particular, are of concern because it is increasingly unaffordable or inaccessible. Thus, a way to remedy this must be factored in to planning;
- A just transition should be about changing political power relations for a more just and equitable society;
- It is also about rooting out corruption and regaining public trust in government and the private sector: many communities are disillusioned;

⁴¹ ‘A Just Transition – our position’, 350.org, <https://350africa.org/just-transition-a-position-paper/>. Accessed 25 May 2021.

⁴² Climate Justice Coalition, (2021) ‘A Green New Eskom’, 2021, p3. https://7lo0w1yurlr3bozjw1hac3st-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/files/2021/05/GreenEskom_Booklet_new2.pdf. Accessed 25 May 2021.

⁴³ See note 24: Halsey (2019), pp. 25–27.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Must result in a net increase in employment opportunities, not only prevent job losses. <p><u>Examples of positions or demands.</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • To be included, and to be heard in a way that is more than a tick-box exercise; • In many workshops, variations on the theme of ‘do not make decisions about us, without us’ have emerged.
--	---

Business and industry
Includes groupings and industry bodies as well as individual entities.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide services and infrastructure; • Employer; • As heavy emitters of greenhouse gases, responsibility to mitigate emissions; • Financial support (e.g. banks). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vary significantly depending on the sector. Some want to accelerate the transition if their business is favoured in a future system (such as renewable energy), others want to delay it if their existing business model is threatened; • Some finance institutions believe certain fossil fuel projects still require support; others have stated they will no longer provide funding; • In a 2019 survey, most business respondents viewed a just transition as a necessity and an opportunity. However, less than a third felt that they were taking any action yet or that their sector was ready to transition.⁴⁴ <p><u>Examples of positions or demands.</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Limited to date, because more often demands are placed on them; • The National Business Initiative (NBI) has a draft vision that the transition ‘needs to be well managed and contribute to the goals of decent work, social inclusion and the eradication of poverty for all South Africans’;⁴⁵ • PricewaterhouseCoopers ‘believe the business community has an important role to play in creating and responding to the changes necessary for climate-resilient development that goes hand in hand with job creation’.⁴⁶
--	--

Sources: This table draws on information from Scholtz (2019), pp. 4–5 and 21–35; D. Hallowes and V. Munnik, ‘Down to Zero: the politics of just transition’, groundWork, 2019, pp 90–130; and the authors’ involvement in relevant discussion fora since 2017.

⁴⁴ L. Scholtz et al., (2019) ‘Deep Transition - Delving into social and economic justice in transitions to a climate-responsive economy’, NBI, WWF and Just Share, 2019, pp. 27–30, annex B, p.6).

⁴⁵ National Business Institute, (2021) ‘Climate Pathways and a Just Transition for South Africa. Overview of Study Findings. 15 April 2021’, p. 55. Presentation made to Energy Governance South Africa on 14 May 2021.

⁴⁶ PricewaterhouseCoopers, (2021) ‘What a ‘just transition’ means for jobs in South Africa’, PwC, 2021, p. 16. <https://www.pwc.co.za/en/assets/pdf/what-a-just-transition-means-for-jobs-in-south-africa.pdf>. Accessed 27 May 2021.



Credit: © Rixipix, Getty Images

V. The role of cities in delivering South Africa's just transition

It can be helpful to focus on “resilience” to highlight the difference between current attempts to address climate change at the city level (e.g. via initiatives such as zero-carbon planning) and the imperatives of achieving a just transition.

Resilience has been at the forefront of a great deal of thinking around how cities can implement adaptation to climate change, particularly as it relates to issues of vulnerability experienced by marginalised and poorer city residents. In the conventional understanding, resilience refers to measures that can be taken to ameliorate the impact of climate-induced disasters on vulnerable groups and to get them “back to normal” as quickly as possible after such disasters.

What is sometimes missing from these orthodox understandings of resilience is any reflection on why certain communities need to be resilient in the first place. What is driving their vulnerability and what profound and far-reaching steps need to be taken to end it? These are some of the fundamental questions posed by the “justice” element of just transition.⁴⁷ They are undoubtedly complex questions that necessitate multi-sectoral responses by cities. Therefore, it is crucial that cities do not limit decision-making around a just transition to only one sector or focus area. Responses must be driven via coordinated action from all relevant city departments if a just transition is to be realised.

⁴⁷ M. Kaika, (2017) “Don’t call me resilient again!”: the New Urban Agenda as immunology ... or ... what happens when communities refuse to be vaccinated with “smart cities” and indicators’, *Environment and Urbanisation*, 29(1), April 2017, p. 95.

5.1 The challenges in South African cities

Major cities in South Africa follow global trends in terms of consumption, production and urbanisation. South Africa's eight metropolitan areas are home to 41% of South Africa's total population (with an additional 27% living in urban areas outside of these eight metropolitan areas) with these figures set to rise significantly in coming years.⁴⁸ Population growth in the largest metropolitan areas has been particularly pronounced in recent years. For example, the population of the City of Cape Town grew by nearly one million between 2009 and 2019, rising from 3.5 million to 4.4 million,⁴⁹ while Johannesburg's population grew even more quickly, rising from 4.1 million in 2009, to 5.4 million in 2019.⁵⁰

The eight metropolitan areas contribute nearly 60% of South Africa's economic activity, with the metropolitan area of Johannesburg alone contributing over 16% of South Africa's annual gross domestic product (GDP).⁵¹ These areas also consume over a third of all electricity, and are responsible for approximately 21% of direct greenhouse gas emissions.⁵²



Credit: © MarkFisher, Shutterstock

Despite these similarities, South Africa's past has shaped its cities in a particular way. During colonialism and apartheid, South African cities were subject to brutal population controls which engineered the spatial segregation of South Africans along racial lines. Prime urban locations were reserved for 'whites' where wealth accumulated, while other South Africans were relegated to peripheral areas often far from city centres. These areas were deliberately underfunded, precipitating the emergence and exponential growth of both townships and informal settlements. Legally barred from engaging in decent, well paid work, the vast majority of residents living in these peripheral areas experienced 'poverty and exclusion, where miserable living conditions meant hardship, insecurity and crime'.⁵³

⁴⁸ 'State of Energy in South African Cities 2020', *Sustainable Energy Africa*, 2020, p. 28. and 'Urban Population (% of total population) South Africa', World Bank, 2018 Revision, <https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SP.URB.TOTL.IN.ZS?locations=ZA>. Accessed 10 May 2021.

⁴⁹ Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, (2020) 'City of Cape Town: Metropolitan WC', 2020, p. 12.

⁵⁰ Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs, (2020) 'City of Johannesburg: Metropolitan GAU', 2020, p. 10.

⁵¹ City of Johannesburg, 'About the City: Economic Data', https://www.joburg.org.za/about_/Pages/About%20the%20City/About%20Joburg/Economic-Data.aspx. Accessed 10 May 2021.

⁵² 'State of Energy in South African Cities 2020', *Sustainable Energy Africa*, 2020, p. 28.

⁵³ I. Turok, (2016) 'South Africa's new urban agenda: Transformation or compensation?', *Local Economy*, 31(1-2), 2016, pp. 11-12.

South Africa's cities still show the effects of their history in their urban fabric. The over-extended spatial form characterised by racial and class divisions essentially persists, with poverty and population densities increasing with distance from affluent city centres. These patterns have been exacerbated by the rapid urbanisation that has taken place since the end of apartheid in 1994 as South Africans moved to cities looking for work. Many have, however, failed to find work which has led to extremely high levels of unemployment in South African cities:

Table 2. Metropolitan unemployment rates

Metropolitan area	Unemployment rate first quarter 2019 (%)*	Unemployment rate fourth quarter 2020 (%)**
Buffalo City	26	36
City of Cape Town	23	29
Ekurhuleni	35	33
eThekweni	23	34
City of Johannesburg	30	41
Mangaung	37	26
Nelson Mandela	38	43
City of Tshwane	31	40

* Source: 'Quarterly Labour Force Survey Quarter 1: 2019', *Statistics South Africa*, 14 May 2019.

** Source: 'Quarterly Labour Force Survey Quarter 4: 2020', *Statistics South Africa*, 23 February 2021.

The average unemployment rate across the eight metropolitan areas was 35% at the end of 2020 compared with 30% in 2019 before the negative economic impacts of the Covid-19 pandemic, while the national unemployment rate is 33% (28% before Covid-19). These high levels of unemployment within cities result in widespread poverty. For example, in 2019, 46% of Cape Town's population lived in poverty according to statistics compiled by the national Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs. The figure for Johannesburg was 46%, while it was 54% for eThekweni.⁵⁴

⁵⁴ Department of Cooperative Governance and Traditional Affairs,(2020) 'City of Cape Town: Metropolitan WC', 2020, p. 6; 'City of Johannesburg: Metropolitan GAU', 2020, p. 15; and 'eThekweni: Metropolitan KZN', 2020, p. 5.

Case study 2:

Green Economy Hub in Cape Town

The Western Cape government was the first provincial government in South Africa to take concrete action to encourage the development of green economic activities within the context of the “green transition”. In 2011 the city of Cape Town provided an area of city-owned land in an economically depressed area, called Atlantis, within which it sought to create a green industrial manufacturing hub. It did so in partnership with a national government initiative, InvestSA, which encourages and facilitates investment in South Africa. The city also partnered with Wesgro, which plays a similar role to InvestSA but is focused on the Western Cape Province, and with GreenCape, a Western Cape government entity used to drive green economic growth. The first significant investment occurred in 2014, and since then three more large manufacturing companies have established themselves in the green hub.⁵⁵

In late 2018, the hub became the first Greentech Special Economic Zone (SEZ) in Africa. By the end of 2019, more than 700 million South African rand (ZAR) in investment had been attracted to the green hub, and 322 permanent jobs had been created for the residents of Atlantis. By 2030 the SEZ hopes to have attracted approximately ZAR 6 billion in investments and created an additional 3000 jobs.⁵⁶ The SEZ now hosts 60% of South Africa’s green developers and over 66% of all green manufacturing facilities.

The implementation of the Renewable Energy Independent Power Producers Procurement Programme (REIPPP) suggests there is clearly great potential for the SEZ to play a significant role in Cape Town’s just transition. Not only will it produce the infrastructure necessary for the transition away from fossil fuels, but it will also provide much needed jobs in a historically deprived area of Cape Town. To maximise its contribution to a just transition the SEZ needs to ensure that the jobs created in it are “decent” jobs, and it must maintain the active support of the local Atlantis community. In this regard, the training of local youths and the creation of the Community Stakeholder Network are commendable steps as means by which to advance local economic development and champion the interests of local people within that development.

While it is beyond the scope of this report to examine how South African cities have tried to address these broad challenges, it is nonetheless important to observe that in general the predominant approach in city policy has been a technical, expert-driven ‘service delivery’ point of view. This approach has resulted in public-private partnerships, market-based ‘efficiency’ in service delivery, and cost recovery

⁵⁵ R. Grant, (2020) ‘A green transition in South Africa? Sociotechnical experimentation in the Atlantis Special Economic Zone’, *Journal of Modern African Studies*, 58(2), 2020, pp. 190–192.

⁵⁶ Atlantis Special Economic Zone, ‘Atlantis Special Economic Zone: Cape Town - Annual Report 2018/19, pp. 5 and 8.



Credit: © Omotayo Tajudeen, Pexels

principles).⁵⁷ To fund this developmentalism, cities have relied on their respective global competitiveness, viewing economic growth as the means by which to provide basic needs.⁵⁸

Despite 25 years of prioritising service delivery the goal of achieving inclusive, harmonious, thriving, and equitable cities has not yet been attained. It is within this context that the concept of a just transition holds so much potential. It offers a completely new paradigm through which to confront the challenges ahead. One of these challenges is that many of the dialogues on just transition have taken place at a national government level without adequate consultation with cities.⁵⁹ The literature review undertaken for this report uncovered only one short report on just transitions in South African cities. Although this report is a welcome and necessary start to the process of understanding urban just transitions in South Africa, it is, as it acknowledges, narrowly focused on the energy sector. Much more research clearly needs to take place to think through what cities can do to further just transitions. This is especially so, given that the NPC Social Partner Dialogue for a Just Transition noted how cities must take on a ‘bigger role and take the lead in the just transition’ in South Africa.⁶⁰ That said, numerous opportunities already exist for South African cities to play important roles in pushing for a genuinely transformative just transition. This will inevitably be a complicated and time-consuming process because current modes of thinking and development will need to be convincingly deconstructed and replaced with new agendas that must gain widespread support from all players and stakeholders to produce just transitions. Thus the starting point for a just transition in South African cities is identifying opportunities.

It is extremely encouraging that both Johannesburg’s and Cape Town’s draft climate action plans mention the need to pursue just transition. For example, Johannesburg’s climate action plan notes that just transition is one of the twelve guiding principles that have informed the plan, stating that any transition must be ‘responsive to the needs of all people in the city.’⁶¹ The City of Cape Town’s climate action plan includes the ILO’s broad and inclusive understanding of a just transition with its focus on social justice.

Implementation of an urban just transition is not a one-off event, but a process, one that can only start if cities acknowledge the need for a just transition. That both Johannesburg and Cape Town are now formally recognising this need is a vital first step.

⁵⁷ L. Tozer et al., (2020) ‘Whose City? Whose nature? Towards inclusive nature-based solution governance’, *Cities*, 107, 2020, p. 2.

⁵⁸ M. Huchzermeyer, (2014) ‘Humanism, creativity and rights: invoking Henri Lefebvre’s right to the city in the tension presented in informal settlements in South Africa today’, *Transformation*, 85, 2014, p. 2.

⁵⁹ L. Hermanus, (2021) ‘South Africa’s Just Urban Transition’, *Just Urban Transitions*, 1 March 2021, https://justurbantransitions.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/Just-Urban-Transitions_PolicyNote1.pdf. Accessed 15 March 2021.

⁶⁰ National Planning Commission, (2019) ‘2050 Vision and Pathways for a Just Transition to a low carbon, climate resilient economy and society’, 2019, p. 26. <https://oneworldgroup.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/NPC-JT-Vision-and-Pathways-draft-2-final.pdf>. Accessed 20 May 2021.

⁶¹ City of Johannesburg Climate Action Plan Draft Version 1.0, City of Johannesburg & C40 Cities, September 2020, pp. 18 and 144.

5.2 Just transition opportunities for South African cities

The opportunities that a just transition provides can be loosely split into two categories: political actions and policy-related developments. However, they are not mutually exclusive because practical opportunities will, of course, need political will behind them to be properly implemented:

- **Political actions and opportunities** address the fundamental question of what kind of cities South Africa wants to create. Such opportunities are often reflected in the vision statements developed by city managers. For example, should there be an emphasis on climate-resilient cities exclusively powered by renewables by 2050, or on equitable and just cities where ‘everyone has social protection; all jobs are decent; emissions are low or at zero; poverty is eliminated; and communities are thriving and resilient’? To achieve equitable and just cities policy-makers will need to adapt their approach to think about cities and their residents, and the organisations within them, rather than the often siloed approaches. Anything less than this will not deliver a genuine just transition;
- **Policy-related developments** will be essential to overcome entrenched city-level social, economic and political approaches. Achieving the vision of an equitable and just city will involve step-by-step rethinking of established methods and processes. Even at this early stage, when the idea of a just transition is still novel, cities are taking actions and developing policies that contribute to this process, even if these actions are not yet consciously part of just transition processes. The speed with which these actions, and new ones, get adopted and expanded will depend on the extent of leverage that the various role players can harness. The more positive gains that can come from practical actions, both social and economic, the more likely it is that core role players will accept the transformative vision of just transition. Therefore, actions urgently need to be taken that convince citizens, private businesses, public entities, and civil society organisations that just transition is in all their respective interests, because none of their interests will be met by cities ravaged by climate change.

5.3 Just transition opportunities for South African cities

Genuine political commitment to participation in just transition processes

Research and practice illustrate that the more inclusive city planning processes around climate change are, the more equity and justice outcomes they produce.⁶² Encouragingly, the right of urban citizens to participate in the governance of cities is already legally established in South Africa via the constitution and enabling legislation and regulations. For example, sections 16–18 of the Municipal Systems Act (2000) state that all municipalities must ‘develop a culture of community participation’ and establish ‘mechanisms, processes and procedures for community participation’.⁶³ However, participatory processes in South Africa’s cities sometimes do not meet the expectations of urban citizens. The reasons for this are very complex, and beyond the scope of this paper, but what is clear is that cities in South Africa need to do

⁶² E. Chu et al., (2016) ‘Inclusive approaches to urban climate adaptation planning and implementation in the Global South’, *Climate Policy*, 16(3), 2016, p. 372.

⁶³ The Local Government: Municipal Systems Act 32 of 2000, <https://www.gov.za/documents/local-government-municipal-systems-act>.

more to generate spaces and forums where communities can meaningfully engage in management and service delivery processes. One of the key findings of the Social Partner Dialogue for a Just Transition undertaken by the NPC (see Box 2) was the need for more community participation in the just transition process to ensure ‘that beneficiaries of initiatives are involved in the decision-making process’.⁶⁴

This is undoubtedly a challenging task, as successful community participation demands both time and resources from cities. For example, communities may lack experience and the necessary skills to participate fully, meaning that capacity-building might need to take place before spaces and forums for participation are even initiated. Participatory governance also presupposes that communities themselves are properly and democratically organised and not subject to gatekeeping. This is another area where time needs to be spent identifying who legitimately speaks for communities. Community members also need to have the time and resources to participate. It is critical to reflect on the well documented fact that in South African cities community participation is often reported to be hampered by the ‘capture’ of local governance structures, such as ward committees and local councillors, where participatory processes are often located, by political and ‘elite’ forces.⁶⁵ This has had, and continues to have, a negative impact on citizens’ perception of participatory processes in South Africa, and speaks to wider concerns with the democratic system in South Africa which are largely outside the control of cities.

Having forums where community members feel they have shared ownership of processes – because they have asked to participate, rather than merely invited to attend – has proven to be successful.⁶⁶ The truth is that there is no short-cut to successful participatory processes and cities may need to go through multiple stages of participation before community voices are genuinely heard. This is complicated by the urgency of the climate crisis which is compelling policy makers to act as soon as they can, creating pressure to minimise the time and resources allocated to participatory decision-making.

Independent audit of anti-poor budget claims

In line with Section 29 of the Municipal Systems Act, cities consult local communities on their needs and priorities as part of the process of developing an IDP. Despite this, accusations that metropolitan city budgets are anti-poor are regularly made in South Africa. These accusations generally take two contradictory forms. Firstly, some metropolitan authorities are accused of drawing up anti-poor budgets, while secondly, they are accused of failing to spend their capital budgets which predominantly target poorer urban residents.⁶⁷ If a genuine just transition is to take place at the city level then these serious claims need to be subject to independent scrutiny because of the heightened vulnerabilities of poor urban residents due to climate change and possible

⁶⁴ National Planning Commission, (2019) ‘2050 Vision and Pathways for a Just Transition to a low carbon, climate resilient economy and society’, 2019, pp. 5 and 23. <https://oneworldgroup.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/NPC-JT-Vision-and-Pathways-draft-2-final.pdf>. Accessed 20 May 2021.

⁶⁵ S. Friedman, (2021) ‘Fixing local government in South Africa needs political solutions, not technical ones’, *The Conversation*, 18 May 2021, <https://theconversation.com/fixing-local-government-in-south-africa-needs-political-solutions-not-technical-ones-161004>. Accessed 20 May 2021.

⁶⁶ International Budget Partnership, (2017) ‘Participatory budgeting: A Case of Delhi’, 2017, p. 1; and L. Sinwell, (2010) ‘Conceptualizing Direct Action as a Form of Participation in Development: A South African Case’, *Politikon*, 37(1), 2010.

⁶⁷ See, for example, ‘An unfair, unequal and unjust budget with no reasonable plans: Submission of the Social Justice Coalition on the Cape Town 2019/20 draft budget, Social Justice Coalition, 24 April 2019; D. Bendile, (2018) ‘DA budgets under fire’, *Mail and Guardian*, 8 June 2018, <https://mg.co.za/article/2018-06-08-00-da-budgets-under-fire/>; and R. Moarshe, (2018) ‘City of Tshwane blasted for spending half of budget’, *IOL News*, 28 June 2018, <https://www.iol.co.za/pretoria-news/city-of-tshwane-blasted-for-spending-half-of-budget-27867588>. Accessed 20 May 2021.

job losses during low carbon transition processes. If metropolitan budgets are found to be insufficiently pro-poor, then they will need to be revised and different plans put in place. It may well be that cities will need to advocate for additional funds from national government or consider increasing rates and service charges for wealthier residents to increase the cross-subsidisation of services to poorer residents. This will, of course, be no easy task given the parlous state of national finances and the likely resistance to increases in charges. If the accusations are found to be false, cities can use the independent audits to defend their budgets and validate the participatory processes they have been following.

It is important to note, however, that simply increasing funds for pro-poor activities and service delivery in line with a just transition will not result in favourable outcomes if cities lack the capacity to properly spend their capital budgets. In addition, if budgets are found to be insufficiently pro-poor, that suggests the participatory processes around budget formation and the drawing up of IDPs needs to be improved, or that campaigns are needed to better inform citizens about how budget and planning processes work and their participation rights in these processes.

Reviewing by-laws

Well-intentioned by-laws aimed at maintaining law and order are sometimes exploited by wealthier residents to call for the criminalisation of the urban poor.⁶⁸ Cities aspiring to be more inclusive and pro-poor should consider reviewing their by-laws and including appropriate exemptions to protect homeless and poor people from being victimised.



Credit: © C40_Inclusive_Climate_Action_in_Practice

⁶⁸ M. Damons, (2021) 'Homeless people challenge Cape Town by-laws in court', Ground Up, 8 April 2021, <https://www.groundup.org.za/article/homeless-people-challenge-cape-town-laws-courts/> Accessed 1 June 2021.

5.3.1 Policy developments

City representation on the Presidential Climate Change Coordinating Commission

Senior representatives from metropolitan areas, including mayors, should push for full representation on the Presidential Climate Change Coordinating Commission to ensure that city voices are heard within this important institution and the role of cities in implementing and delivering a just transition is recognised at the highest level and can be a core part of the recommendations from the Commission.

Coordinated approach from city management structures and functions

Because of the complexity and cross-cutting nature of the changes that will need to take place to realise just transitions, cities must fully coordinate their responses. This means that the implementation of just transitions cannot become the responsibility of single or limited departments or functions within city management structures. To encourage harmonised multi-sectoral responses cities may consider establishing an internal cross department just transition structure to ensure coordinated action. For such a structure to succeed it must be properly funded and have the full support of executive authorities within cities. Mayoral committee members should be encouraged to participate in such structures.

City-level just transition commissions to entrench social dialogue

Research shows that ‘building multi-sector governance institutions that ensure tight and multilevel relationships between government and civil society actors ... can enhance programme stability and ensure that diverse civil society actors have ongoing voices in adaptation planning and implementation.’⁶⁹ Meaningful social dialogue results in consensus building, which is a necessary condition for the effective implementation of just transition processes and plans. The formation of a broadly representative just transition coordinating structure or commission at the city level could be useful to both guide the process and entrench greater participation. Such a structure would need to be democratically organised and include all relevant role players at the city level (government, labour, community representatives, private sector, civil society organisations etc.). Such a structure must be mindful of the different ranges of experiences and different types of expertise that members will bring, and not prioritise the views of “experts”.

Case study 3:

Waste pickers in Johannesburg

Like most large cities, Johannesburg faces the ongoing challenge of the disposal of solid waste within the context of diminishing landfill disposal space. Recognising the key role that waste pickers were playing in the recovery and

⁶⁹ See note 62: Chu (2016), p. 391.

recycling of waste, in 2010, the city launched the Waste Pickers Empowerment programme. This programme, undertaken in partnership with the city's waste management service provider, Pikitup, registered waste pickers with the city, offered skills training, protective clothing and waste trolleys, and organised waste pickers into cooperatives. By 2014, 500 waste pickers had benefited from the programme and 20 cooperatives had been formed. Due to the 'onerous financial implications of implementing the projects' funding and support were sourced from private companies to ensure the sustainability of the project.⁷⁰ At the end of 2019, the city reported that 25 waste picker cooperatives had signed agreements with Pikitup, some of which had received training and support from Pikitup during the year.⁷¹ By the second quarter of 2020/21, an additional 12 cooperatives had signed contracts.⁷²

While these are very encouraging developments, the incorporation of waste pickers into the city's formal solid waste management process has not been without its difficulties. One of the most pressing challenges has been communication and consultation between the city and waste pickers themselves, an issue identified from the earliest stages of the programme, and which appears to be ongoing.⁷³ Some waste pickers feel that waste management staff lack the necessary understanding of the challenges facing waste pickers, and consequently propose solutions that are not appropriate. Waste pickers have also complained of being harassed by taxi drivers, motorists and traffic police while transporting waste to recycling centres.⁷⁴ Research has also drawn attention to a failure of both pickers and city authorities to understand what integration and incorporation means in terms of overall waste management strategies in the city. As one expert notes 'integration is not about creating special projects to bring poor, marginal reclaimers into recycling and municipal waste management systems; it is about integrating reclaimers and "sort at source" into how we understand and intervene in these systems'.⁷⁵

The formalisation of work by waste pickers is an objective that meets with the overall goals of a just urban transition: waste picking provides income for some of the most marginalised city residents, while they collect as much as 90% of all paper and packaging disposed of in South Africa, saving municipalities up to ZAR 750 million per year.⁷⁶

⁷⁰ M. Baker et al., (2016) 'Empowerment of Waste Pickers in the City of Johannesburg, creating an enabling environment for the informal waste sector to participate in municipal waste service delivery', Institute of Waste Management of Southern Africa, 2016.

⁷¹ City of Johannesburg, 'Pikitup Integrated Annual Report, 2018/19', p. 19. See also <http://www.pikitup.co.za/>.

⁷² City of Johannesburg, (2020) 'Pikitup Quarter 2 Performance Report 2020-2021', 2020, p. 48.

⁷³ See note 69: Baker (2016) p. 177; M. Sekhwela and M. Samson, (2020) 'Contested Understandings of Reclaimer Integration - Insights from a Failed Johannesburg Pilot Project', Urban Forum, 31, 2020; and M. Samson, (2020) 'Building from what already exists: integrating reclaimers into our understanding of the recycling economy', *Waste RDI Roadmap Briefing Note Series*, Department of Science and Innovation, Wits University and the CSIR, 2020.

⁷⁴ S. Dlamini and D. Simatele, (2016) 'Unrecognised informal solid waste recycling in an emerging African megacity: a study of Johannesburg, South Africa', *WIT Transactions on Ecology and the Environment*, 202, 2016; D. Simatele et al., (2017) 'From informality to formality: Perspectives on the challenges of integrating solid waste management into the urban development and planning policy in Johannesburg, South Africa', *Habitat International*, 63, 2017.

⁷⁵ See note 72: Samson (2020), p. 5.

⁷⁶ M. Samson, (2021) 'Johannesburg is threatening to sideline informal waste pickers. Why it's a bad idea', *The Conversation*, 4 May 2021, <https://theconversation.com/johannesburg-is-threatening-to-sideline-informal-waste-pickers-why-its-a-bad-idea-159969>. Accessed 22 May 2021.

The lessons learned by the metro can be applied to all South African cities, given that many are supporting the integration of waste pickers into waste management policies. However, it should be noted that within the context of just transition, being a waste picker is not an example of “decent work”. But as has already been noted, just transition is a process, not an event. Although the ultimate goal of a just transition in this example is formal incorporation and professionalisation of waste pickers into the recycling sector where they can bargain collectively and receive decent salaries and employee benefits, it is an objective that can only be realised over time.

Creation of just transition community officers or advocates

Equally, there is clearly a need to strengthen education for citizens on just transition and what it means within cities. While this is related to the wider national advocacy role of the Presidential Climate Change Coordinating Commission, it is also incumbent on any city-level just transition structure to popularise its objectives. One way this could take place is via the appointment of just transition ‘officers’ or ‘advocates’ who could be drawn from within communities, trained on the objectives of just transition and then tasked with taking these objectives back to communities.⁷⁷ These advocates should not just be concentrated in poorer areas, because all city residents need to be educated about the necessity of pursuing just transition.

Entrench the just transition into the IDP process

Another route to entrench just transition principles and public participation into city planning would be via its wholesale incorporation into IDPs. Although it varies from city to city, public participation in the IDP process is slowly becoming more entrenched in South Africa. Given the long-term visions projected in IDPs, they are the ideal vehicle to use to build towards urban just transition.

Embed the just transition into city climate action plans

City plans to address climate change should also incorporate the wider objectives of the just transition. Encouragingly, both Cape Town’s and Johannesburg’s draft climate action plans reference the concept of just transition. While this has been defined in terms of protecting vulnerable workers, the fact that it is mentioned clearly demonstrates how the concept is permeating thinking and planning at the city level. Although it does not use the term “just transition”, Durban’s climate action plan also articulates an inclusive response to climate change that bodes well for the subsequent development of a strong just transition vision for the city.⁷⁸

⁷⁷ E. Chu et al., (2018) ‘Conclusion: Multilevel Governance and Climate Change Innovations in Cities’, in Hughes (2018) p. 367.

⁷⁸ Ethekewini Municipality, (2019) ‘Durban Climate Action Plan 2019’, Ethekewini Municipality, 2019, pp. 73–76.



Credit: © Justin Lim Fpcy, Unsplash

Entrench just transition principles into climate change adaptation and resilience programmes

Cities face several significant hazards from climate change, including increased risks of flooding and fires and, for those cities located on the coast, sea-level rises that will result in coastal erosion. Cities are already engaged in adaptive environmental management initiatives, such as clearing invasive vegetation or maintaining wetlands to adapt to these threats. These climate resilience and adaptive processes provide job opportunities within those urban communities who are most likely to be impacted adversely by climate change. The ILO argues that adaptation and resilience measures can provide thousands of jobs, while safeguarding many more that rely on the sustainable management of the environment.⁷⁹ Therefore, climate adaptation management practices could usefully become part of just transition plans at the city level.

The national government's Expanded Public Works Programme already provides opportunities in this sector with participants at the city level working on climate adaptation projects. However, for any climate adaptation job to be considered part of a just transition it would need to meet the ILO's definition of 'decent work'. Engage and support for the informal economy during just transition

Given the importance of informal economic activity within cities, efforts should be made to ensure that informal workers are central just transition plans. This is especially so given that many activities undertaken by workers in the informal sector, such as waste picking and small-scale subsistence urban agriculture, are crucial to efforts to reach net-zero emissions targets and are also undertaken by some of the most vulnerable city residents, especially women. Formalising and supporting informal work in these areas can also help recognise informal work as green jobs and core to a climate transition. There are also potential transition issues such as landfill closures or changing waste practices that could lead to job losses if informal work isn't considered and supported through just transition plans. Research indicates that when collaboration occurs between informal sector workers such as waste pickers and city managers, outcomes tend to be more beneficial not only in terms of specific targeted outputs,

⁷⁹ International Labour Organization, (2018) 'The employment impact of climate change adaptation', August 2018, pp. 7-8.

but also in terms of local inclusion and rights to the city.⁸⁰ (See case studies 3 and 4.)

Energy utility decentralisation

South African metropolitan areas, led by Cape Town, have been at the forefront of pushing national government to allow metros to generate their own electricity. Due to this concerted pressure, the Minister for Energy, Gwede Mantashe, announced in October 2020 that qualifying municipalities would now be able to generate or procure their own electricity.⁸¹

This encouraging development enables cities to be at the forefront of utility-scale energy decentralisation processes that look to break the centralised energy generation monopoly that currently exists in South Africa. Directly providing or sourcing their own electricity will enable cities to exercise localised governance that should, in theory, lead to increased energy efficiency and more responsive energy management. If this energy is sourced from renewable sources, which it most likely will be given that renewable sources are now categorically the cheapest form of energy generation, then climate benefits will also flow from this process.

The challenge for cities is to plan for more just access to electricity within the context of an urban just transition. This will be no easy task given the ageing state of distribution infrastructure. However, the development of city-level generation and distribution networks provides an opportunity to undertake the manufacturing, maintenance and upgrading (e.g. smart grids, battery storage) that will be required. The challenge will be how to finance this transition, because the ability of cities to raise the necessary finances from rates and service charges is limited.

Case study 4:

eThekwini Integrated Resource Plan

Currently there is no legislative requirement for metropolitan municipalities in South Africa to produce integrated resource plans (IRPs) because energy policy is highly centralised in terms of generation and governance via national IRP development. However, the government has now recognised that it cannot solve the country's energy crisis without letting other entities, such as metros, produce and source their own electricity.

Within this context the eThekwini Metro Municipality produced its own IRP in 2020, which sets out the metro's energy strategy up until 2050. The eThekwini IRP has three stated aims:

⁸⁰ D. Brown and G. McGranahan, (2016) 'The urban informal economy, local inclusion and achieving a global green transformation', *Habitat International*, 53, 2016, p. 102.

⁸¹ T. Creamer, (2020) 'Electricity regulations amended to allow municipalities to develop or buy power', *Engineering News*, 16 October 2020, <https://www.engineeringnews.co.za/article/electricity-regulations-amended-to-allow-municipalities-to-develop-or-buy-power-2020-10-16>. Accessed 20 May 2021.

- Creation of an evidence-base for a Ministerial Determination request for the Municipality to procure energy from IPPs, as envisaged in the New Generation Capacity regulations;
- Development of a clear plan for roll-out of municipality-owned power generation assets as a way of increasing revenues for the municipality;
- Clarification of the scale of investment (domestic and foreign) needed for eThekweni's clean energy transition.⁸²

The plan commits the city to providing 40% of its energy from renewables by 2030, and 100% by 2050, all of which it hopes to generate or procure outside of Eskom. This ambition sits alongside those contained in the city's climate action plan which commits it to 100% renewable energy generation by 2050.⁸³ The plan is informed by extensive modelling and sets out a convincing case for this vital transition, showing that it is both possible and cost-effective.

This is a very positive first step, but further developments need to take place to ensure that the process aligns with an urban just transition. For example further consultation could be pursued with local community members and residents.

It is encouraging that the eThekweni IRP recognises that the metro may own some utility-scale installations, suggesting the next bold step it could take is to look at how it can implement community-owned projects as well.



Credit: © Michael Jung, Getty Images

⁸² eThekweni Metro Municipality & C40 Cities, (2020) eThekweni Integrated Resource Plan, Draft 2020, June 2020, p. 16.
⁸³ eThekweni Municipality, (2019) 'Durban Climate Action Plan 2019: Towards Climate Resilience and Carbon Neutrality', eThekweni Municipality, 2019.

Support for community-owned energy

To further the objectives of an urban just transition, cities should consider exploring the installation of community-owned renewable energy infrastructure, rather than solely pursuing privately owned renewable energy. Evidence from around the world indicates that community-owned energy cooperatives can deliver real socioeconomic benefits to community members via the promotion of energy justice. While various community ownership models exist, those most aligned with the concept of just transition are run as either cooperatives or not-for-profit enterprises. These types of projects use revenue generated from the sale of electricity to support wider community development projects or assist indigent community members who cannot afford to pay for electricity.

The most significant hurdle that such projects need to overcome is sourcing the initial funding for project development. This is an area where cities and lending institutions such as the Development Bank of South Africa or the Public Investment Corporation could step in by offering soft loans or by acting as guarantors. Cities can also assist in the development of community-owned energy projects by releasing suitable land, and by streamlining and simplifying local planning permission processes.⁸⁴

As a starting point, cities could perhaps engage in co-financing arrangements whereby they own a percentage of community developments proportional to how much financing they put in. It may well be that initially cities would fund 75% of a project, an amount that could fall with each subsequent successful project. Community energy projects do not need to focus on utility-scale plants connected to the grid: they can be usefully deployed at a much smaller scale as part of microgrid infrastructures.

While it is still very much in a developmental state, the Western Cape provincial government's Municipal Energy Resilience project does not appear to currently be focussed with issues of energy justice. The aim of the project is to enable 'economic growth through improving energy security, reducing business costs, building business confidence and attracting investment'.⁸⁵ As energy experts argue, the 're-imagining of an inclusive and sustainable energy system' requires that all role players be included in planning energy systems'.⁸⁶ This is something that cities must consider when grasping the new opportunities that are arising in South Africa from changes in the electricity sector.

Access to climate finance

Cities will need financial assistance to be able to meaningfully partake in urban just transitions. To date, international climate finance has been predominantly focused on national governments, making it difficult for cities to directly access these funds despite the critical role they play in meeting climate goals. In addition, research in South Africa on how to finance the just transition has been almost entirely aimed on transitioning the energy sector within the national context.⁸⁷ To facilitate just urban transitions in

⁸⁴ Ring-fenced increases in service charges to wealthier city residents could be used to subsidise the development of community energy projects. See N. Overy, (2018) 'The Role of Ownership in a Just Energy Transition', Project 90 by 2030, 2018.

⁸⁵ Western Cape Government, (2020) 'Terms of Reference for the Procurement of a Service Provider to Provide Project Development Services for the Municipal Energy Resilience Project in the Western Cape', December 2020, p. 1.

⁸⁶ State of Energy in South African Cities 2020', Sustainable Energy Africa, 2020, p. 129.

⁸⁷ See, for example, 'The Role of Transition Finance for Climate Mitigation: A Just Climate Transaction for South Africa', *Meridian Economics*, May 2020; 'The PIC, Eskom Debt and Financing a Just Energy Transition', Alternative Information and Development Centre, 2020; and 'South African Climate Finance Landscape 2020', *Climate Policy Initiative*, January 2021.

South Africa, cities need to be able to directly access multilateral and international climate funds or to receive transfers of these funds from the national government.⁸⁸ In addition, they need to be properly included in transition planning exercises and plans that focus on how to finance the just transition. Funds are potentially available from international sources such as bilateral donors including The Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit GmbH (GIZ), UK AID, US AID and Agence Française de Développement (AFD) as well as multilateral funds such as the Green Climate Fund, the Adaptation Fund and the Global Environment Facility. City-specific funds also exist, as shown in table 3.

Table 3.

Source	Name of fund
World Bank and the European Investment Bank	City Climate Finance Gap ⁸⁹
Global Covenant of Mayors for Climate & Energy	Invest4Cities ⁹⁰
Green Climate Fund	Green Cities ⁹¹

South African cities can also access the South African government’s Green Fund which is administered by the Development Bank of South Africa.

Transport and just transition

Given the spatial challenges that face South African cities because of their colonial and apartheid pasts, how transport is planned and implemented is crucial for urban just transition. Ample evidence of this link was provided by the numerous references made to transport during the NPC Social Partner Dialogue for a Just Transition hearings.⁹²

Research indicates that South Africans spend, on average, 2.5 times more time commuting to work than Europeans.⁹³ This has serious consequences for issues of equity, in terms of time lost to travel, transport costs and gendered divisions of labour. It also has environmental consequences because of the increased carbon emissions that come from extended journeys. There is therefore significant opportunity in areas of green public transport to create jobs and also reduce emissions. Encouragingly, metropolitan cities in South Africa are attempting to address these spatial difficulties. For example, Cape Town’s Comprehensive Integrated Transport Plan 2018–2023

⁸⁸ ‘South Africa’s Proposed Updated Nationally Determined Contribution (2021): Comments by the Cities Vertical Integration Working Group’, City of Cape Town, City of Tshwane, City of Johannesburg and EThekweni (Durban), 2021, p. 10.

⁸⁹ See <https://www.citygapfund.org/>. Accessed 21 May 2021.

⁹⁰ See <https://www.globalcovenantofmayors.org/city-climate-finance/>. Accessed 21 May 2021.

⁹¹ See <https://www.greenclimate.fund/project/fp086>. Accessed 21 May 2021.

⁹² National Planning Commission, (2019) ‘2050 Vision and Pathways for a Just Transition to a low carbon, climate resilient economy and society’, 2019. <https://oneworldgroup.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/NPC-JT-Vision-and-Pathways-draft-2-final.pdf>.

⁹³ See note 53: Turok (2016), p. 13.

acknowledges the need to prioritise transport-oriented development (TOD) to overcome spatial limitations and reduce journey times. In short, it acknowledges the importance of access to land and acknowledges the need to address development, including densification and the development of social housing, in well-located brown- and greenfield sites.⁹⁴ In eThekweni, funding from the UK's Partnering for Accelerated Climate Transitions Pact, will result in TOD in Durban.⁹⁵

Competition exists in South African cities between the informal transport sector, characterised by the taxi industry, and city efforts to expand public transport infrastructure by expanding bus networks in particular. These bus rapid transit (BRT) systems, such as Cape Town's MyCiti and Johannesburg's Rea Vaya, are heavily subsidised by funds from national government and cities. These subsidies cause resentment within the taxi industry, which receives no subsidy support from government despite carrying the majority of urban passengers in South Africa's cities. Many city residents choose taxis over buses because they are more easily accessible than buses.⁹⁶

Given the popularity of the informal taxi sector in South African cities it clearly has an important role to play in facilitating affordable and equitable access to transport within the context of just transition. Experts have suggested for example that the taxi industry should be more formally incorporated into the public transport sector and should receive subsidy support specifically targeted at reducing costs for commuters who use taxis.⁹⁷ There are encouraging signs that this process is underway with the Competition Commission recently recommending a subsidy for the taxi industry.⁹⁸ Cities are also recognising that BRT systems need to be better integrated into the particular spatial patterns of urban development. For example, Johannesburg's Corridors of Freedom initiative is attempting to bring development and transport into closer contact in the same way as Cape Town's TOD.

In terms of an urban just transition, cities may also consider introducing congestion charges on private vehicles. This can act as an incentive to use public transport and can provide funding for green transport projects such as the introduction of electric buses.⁹⁹

⁹⁴ City of Cape Town, (2018) 'Comprehensive Integrated Transport Plan 2018 - 2023', 2018.

⁹⁵ Godurban, (2021) 'Global Future Cities Programme celebrates one year of delivery in South Africa', Godurban, 8 April 2021, <https://www.godurban.co.za/global-future-cities-programme-celebrates-one-year-of-delivery-in-south-africa/>. Accessed 5 July 2021.

⁹⁶ C. Venter and G. Hayes, (2017) 'South Africa needs to revamp its new public transport system', *The Conversation*, 12 October 2017, <https://theconversation.com/south-africa-needs-to-revamp-its-new-public-transport-system-84930>. Accessed 21 May 2021.

⁹⁷ S. Fobosi, (2020) 'South Africa's minibus taxi industry has been marginalised for too long. This must change', *The Conversation*, 14 July 2020, <https://theconversation.com/south-africas-minibus-taxi-industry-has-been-marginalised-for-too-long-this-must-change-142060>; and B. Bradlow and H. Schalekamp, (2020) 'Subsidies for South Africa's minibus taxis must prioritise needs of passengers - and cities', *The Conversation*, 11 November 2020, <https://theconversation.com/subsidies-for-south-africas-minibus-taxis-must-prioritise-needs-of-passengers-and-cities-149549>. Accessed 21 May 2021.

⁹⁸ V. Mchunu, (2021) 'Mooted taxi subsidy "to benefit workers"', *The Mercury*, 12 April 2021., <https://www.iol.co.za/mercury/news/mooted-taxi-subsidy-to-benefit-workers-4f268368-f0a2-4f3f-bcce-22baba75f7d4>. Accessed 21 May 2021.

⁹⁹ South Africa's first electric bus entered service in Cape Town on 5 July 2021. See, V. Ludidi, 'Golden Arrow leads fight to cut emissions with first electric bus in SA', *IOL*, <https://www.iol.co.za/weekend-argus/news/golden-arrow-leads-fight-to-cut-emissions-with-first-electric-bus-in-sa-e057c0a4-46e6-4e2d-8d0d-f43d6e454d42>. Accessed 5 July 2021.



Credit: © Sol, Unsplash

VI. Conclusion

For a transformative just transition to take place in South Africa, it is obvious that cities cannot be left behind and can in fact help drive the process. Cities are crucial to the debate on just transition, not only because they contribute so much to the causes of climate change, but because there are so many opportunities for them to deliver actions in the process which will result in positive outcomes (co-benefits) for cities and their inhabitants. For cities to be able to maximise the positive role they can play in a just transition they need to be recognised on the national stage where they can contribute their unique perspectives and considerable skills. By doing so, they will be able to help shape the debates, development, and implementation of policy for a just transition in South Africa.

Through being involved these national debates, cities will be in a stronger position to think through what a just transition means at the city level. For any city-level transition to be genuinely transformative and offer a Green New Deal to urban South Africans, cities need to do everything they reasonably can, within the constraints of budgets, capacity and time, to meaningfully engage with their citizens because a just transition is not a technical problem that needs only technical solutions. This level of engagement is no easy task and presupposes considerable debate, information sharing, extensive planning, project implementation oversight and city accountability. But by embracing this challenge, cities can, with their residents, co-create a comprehensive and inclusive urban just transition. Furthermore offering residents a genuine sense of ownership over plans will be essential for cities to transition towards the truly just and equitable cities.

There is no doubt that implementing a genuinely transformative urban just transition is a very significant undertaking, one that presupposes 'paradigmatic shifts and an institutional revolution in city management'.¹⁰⁰ But transformative and systemic change is necessary to confront climate change, undoubtedly the most serious challenge that the world's cities have ever faced. To borrow and tweak a phrase from the labour and climate movement, 'There are no cities on a dead planet!'

¹⁰⁰ S. Parnell and E. Pieterse, (2010) 'The "Right to the City": Institutional Imperatives of a Developmental State', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 34, March 2010, p. 151.

Further Reading

This section contains key resources that will assist South African cities in understanding how to realise urban just transitions.

Websites:

South African / African

Abahlali baseMjondolo - <https://abahlali.org/>

African Centre for Cities - <https://www.africancentreforcities.net/>

African Urban Research Initiative - <https://africanurbanresearchinitiative.net/>

National Treasury Cities Support Programme - <https://csp.treasury.gov.za/csp/Pages/default.aspx>

Planact - <https://planact.org.za/>

Reclaim the City - <http://reclaimthecity.org.za/>

South African Cities Network - <https://www.sacities.net/>

Sustainability Institute - <https://www.sustainabilityinstitute.net/>

The Centre of Excellence in Urbanization and Habitable Cities (African Research Universities Alliance) - <https://aru.org.za/centres-of-excellence/the-centre-of-excellence-in-urbanization-and-habitable-cities/>

Global

C40 Cities - <https://www.c40.org/>

Carbon Neutral Cities Alliance - <https://carbonneutralcities.org/>

Centre for Sustainable, Healthy and Learning Cities and Neighbourhoods - <http://www.centreforsustainablecities.ac.uk/about/>

Cities Alliance - <https://www.citiesalliance.org/>

City to City Network - <https://city2city.network/>

Coalition for Urban Transitions - <https://coalitionforurbantransitions.org/>

Ecodistricts - <https://ecodistricts.org/>

European Commission: Climate Adaptation in Cities - https://ec.europa.eu/info/eu-regional-and-urban-development/topics/cities-and-urban-development/priority-themes-eu-cities/climate-adaptation-cities_en

Global Covenant of Mayors for Climate and Energy - <https://www.globalcovenantofmayors.org/>

Global Waste Pickers Alliance - <https://globalrec.org/>

Institute for Development Studies: Cities - <https://www.ids.ac.uk/clusters-and-teams/cities/>

International Institute for Environment and Development: Urban - <https://www.iied.org/transition-predominantly-urban-world>

Local Governments for Sustainability - <https://www.iclei.org/en/Home.html>

Pocacito - European Post Carbon Cities of Tomorrow - <https://pocacito.eu/>

Racetozero - <https://racetozero.unfccc.int/>

Resilient Cities Network - <https://resilientcitiesnetwork.org/>

Ross Centre for Sustainable Cities - <https://wrirosscities.org/>

Slum Dwellers International - <https://sdinet.org/>

Transition Network - <https://transitionnetwork.org/>

Un-Habitat - <https://unhabitat.org/>

United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (Just Transition Research Collaborative (Phase II): Cities in Transition—Urban Struggles for Just Transition(s)) - <https://www.unrisd.org/jtrc-cities>

Urban Transitions Alliance - <https://urbantransitions.org/>

Research reports

The following are the ten most relevant research reports relating to just urban transitions and “just transition” more generally in South Africa. Further resources are provided in the references.

Urban just transitions

P. Brennan et al., ‘Transition Township: Kwazakhele and the Co-operative Space’, in V. Satgar, *Co-operatives in South Africa: Advancing Solidarity Economy Pathways from Below*, UKZN Press, Durban, 2019.

D. Brown and G. McGranahan, ‘The urban informal economy, local inclusion and achieving a global green transformation’, *Habitat International*, 53, 2016.

‘Climate Justice from Below - Local Struggles for Just Transition(s)’, Just Transition Research Collaborative (Phase II): *Cities in Transition—Urban Struggles for Just Transition(s)* - United Nations Research Institute for Social Development & Rosa-Luxemburg-Stiftung, 2019.

E. Chu et al., ‘Inclusive approaches to urban climate adaptation planning and implementation in the Global South’, *Climate Policy*, 16(3), 2016.

A. Friendly, ‘The right to the city: theory and practise in Brazil’, *Planning Theory & Practice*, 14(2), 2013.

L. Hermanus, ‘South Africa’s Just Urban Transition’, *Just Urban Transitions*, 1 March 2021.

S. Hughes et al., *Climate Change in Cities: Innovations in Multi-Level Governance*, Springer, 2018.

S. Hughes and M. Hoffman, 'Just Urban Transitions: Toward a Research Agenda', *Wires Climate Change*, 11(3), 2020.

S. Parnell and E. Pieterse, 'The "Right to the City": Institutional Imperatives of a Developmental State', *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 34, March 2010.

M. Samson, 'Building from what already exists: integrating reclaimers into our understanding of the recycling economy', *Waste RDI Roadmap Briefing Note Series, Department of Science and Innovation, Wits University and the CSIR*, 2020.

The just transition in South Africa

'2050 Vision and Pathways for a Just Transition to a low carbon, climate resilient economy and society', National Planning Commission, 2019. Available at: <https://oneworldgroup.co.za/wp-content/uploads/2019/10/NPC-JT-Vision-and-Pathways-draft-2-final.pdf>.

'A Just Energy Transition in South Africa - Socio-economic needs and the positive impacts of a future low-carbon economy', Res4Africa, 2020. Available at: <https://www.res4africa.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/RES4Africa-Foundation-A-Just-Energy-Transition-in-South-Africa.pdf>.

'A just transition to a low-carbon and climate resilient economy', COSATU, 2017. Available at: https://www.sagreenfund.org.za/wordpress/wp-content/uploads/2017/05/Naledi_A-just-transition-to-a-climate-resilient-economy.pdf.

J. Burton et al., 'Socio-Economic Considerations for a Paris Agreement-Compatible Coal Transition in South Africa', Climate Transparency, 2019. Available at: <https://www.climate-transparency.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/CT-Just-Transition-in-South-Africa.pdf>.

D. Hallowes & V. Munnik, 'Down to Zero: the politics of just transition', groundWork, 2019. Available at: https://lifeaftercoal.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/gW_Report_2019-Down-to-Zero.pdf.

R. Halsey et al., 'Remaking our Energy Future: Towards a Just Energy Transition (JET) in South Africa,' Project 90 by 2030, 2019. Available at: <https://90by2030.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/Remaking-our-Energy-Future.pdf>.

M. Huxam, 'Understanding the impact of a low carbon transition on South Africa', Climate Policy Initiative, 2019. Available at: <https://lifeaftercoal.org.za/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/CPI-Report-South-Africa-25.03.19-Understanding-impact-of-low-carbon-transition-on-SA.pdf>.

N. Makgetla et al., 'The SJRP Toolbox: Summary for Policy Makers', Trade & Industrial Policy Strategies, 2020. Available at: https://www.tips.org.za/images/TIPS_for_DEFF-dtic_-_SJRP_-_Summary_for_Policy_Makers_May_2020.pdf.

'No going back to normal: imagining a just recovery in South Africa', The Institute for Economic Justice, 350Africa.org and the Climate Justice Coalition, 2020. Available at: <https://7lo0w1yurlr3bozjw1hac3st-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/files/2020/10/Full-Just-Recovery-Report-ForWeb.pdf>.

M. Ward et al., 'Supporting Just Transitions in South Africa' Climate Investment Funds, 2021. Available at: https://www.climateinvestmentfunds.org/sites/cif_enc/files/knowledge-documents/supporting_just_transitions_in_south_africa.pdf.

Podcasts and webinars

Urban just transitions

Series of webinars on urban Just Transitions, Urban Transition Alliance, <https://urbantransitions.org/webinars/>. Accessed 25 May 2021.

‘Webinar series: Cities and a green and just recovery’, C40 Cities, https://www.c40knowledgehub.org/s/article/Webinar-series-Cities-and-a-green-and-just-recovery?language=en_US. Accessed 25 May 2021.

South Africa and the just transition

‘Energy Shift: How can Africa ensure a just transition?’, Africa Climate Conversations, <https://tinyurl.com/4ejhpk5m>. Accessed 25 May 2021.

‘Just us and the Climate’ - A series of podcasts from South Africa’s Climate Justice Coalition - <https://pod.link/cjc>. Accessed 27 May 2021.

‘Mandy Rambharos on Eskom’s new Just Energy Transition office’, ESI Africa Podcast, Women in Energy, <https://5e5622eb7838c9-10172942.castos.com/player/415173>. Accessed 25 May 2021.

‘Just Transitions Podcast: Local Lessons and Global Insights from South Africa’ - Brenda Martin and Mike Ward, Climate Investment Funds, <https://www.climateinvestmentfunds.org/news/just-transitions-podcast-local-lessons-and-global-insights-south-africa>. Accessed 25 May 2021.

‘Unravelling South Africa’s Just Transition: Unpacking sectoral interventions for Mpumalanga’ TIPS Webinar, <https://www.tips.org.za/events/development-dialogue-seminar/item/4019-just-transition-unpacking-sectoral-interventions-for-mpumalanga>. (Includes links to six earlier webinars in the series) Accessed 28 May 2021.

‘Unlocking a just energy transition for SA’ - Mark Swilling, Nedbank and EE Publishers, 2019. <https://youtu.be/rOhNsVzjQ8A>. Accessed 28 May 2021.